

Type I Planetary Migration with MHD Turbulence

Gregory Laughlin,¹ Adriane Steinacker,² and Fred C. Adams³

¹Lick Observatory, University of California, Santa Cruz, CA 95064

²NASA Ames Research Center, Moffett Field, CA 94035

³Michigan Center for Theoretical Physics, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48109

Received _____; accepted _____

ABSTRACT

This paper examines how type I planet migration is affected by the presence of turbulent density fluctuations in the circumstellar disk. For type I migration, the planet does not clear a gap in the disk and its secular motion is driven by torques generated by the wakes it creates in the surrounding disk fluid. MHD turbulence creates additional density perturbations that gravitationally interact with the planet and can dominate the torques produced by the migration mechanism itself. This paper shows that conventional type I migration can be readily overwhelmed by turbulent perturbations and hence the usual description of type I migration should be modified in locations where the magnetorotational instability is active. In general, the migrating planet does not follow a smooth inward trend, but rather exhibits a random walk through phase space. Our main conclusion is that MHD turbulence will alter the time scales for type I planet migration and – because of chaos – requires the time scales to be described by a distribution of values.

Subject headings: planets: formation – extrasolar planets

1. Introduction

Ever since their initial discovery (Mayor & Queloz 1995, Marcy & Butler 1996), extrasolar planets have been found in unexpectedly short-period orbits. Since theories of planet formation suggest that planets must form further out in the disk (e.g., Lissauer 1993), these findings strongly indicate the necessity of planetary migration (e.g., Lin, Bodenheimer, & Richardson 1996). A variety of migration scenarios have been suggested. Type I migration (Ward 1997) occurs when a planet (or protoplanet) is embedded in a

circumstellar gaseous disk and the planet’s mass is too small to clear a gap in the disk. In this case, the planet drives wakes into the background fluid of the disk and these wakes, in turn, exert torques on the planet. These torques are generally greater in the inward direction than in the outward direction, and a net inward migration occurs.

These same disks are expected to contain magnetic fields that are subject to a robust instability (Balbus & Hawley 1991), for regimes in which an ideal-MHD description is adequate. The nonlinear outcome of this magneto-rotational instability is MHD-driven turbulence. Indeed, MHD-driven turbulence is commonly invoked as a primary source of disk viscosity which can drive mass accretion through the disk. The usual scenario for type I migration, however, implicitly assumes a smooth background, uninterrupted by turbulence. Given that such turbulence, along with associated stochastic density fluctuations in the disk gas may often be present, we re-examine the type I migration scenario by considering the dynamical evolution of embedded protoplanets that are torqued by transient density perturbations arising from MHD turbulence.

The effects of large-scale turbulence on type II migration, where the planet clears a gap in the disk (e.g., Goldreich & Tremaine 1980; Lin & Papaloizou 1993), has been explored recently (Nelson & Papaloizou 2003; Papaloizou & Nelson 2003; Winters, Balbus, & Hawley 2003). In a related vein, Terquem (2003) has considered the possibility of stopping inward migration by a strong toroidal magnetic field. These previous papers show how turbulence and magnetic fields can produce important modifications to the standard migration picture. This present work carries out a complementary analysis for type I migration.

Our approach to the problem is as follows. We first compute a representative three-dimensional MHD simulation (§2) in a circumstellar disk and use the results to quantify the spectrum of nonlinear density perturbations that are produced by MHD-driven turbulence. These density perturbations provide a stochastic time-varying gravitational

torque on any embedded protoplanets that are orbiting in the disk. Our next step is to construct a parametric model which characterizes the essential aspects of the spectrum of turbulent density fluctuations that are observed in the three-dimensional simulation. This model is described in terms of a time-varying non-axisymmetric potential function (§3). The resulting prescription for the perturbations is then applied to two-dimensional hydrodynamical simulations of circumstellar disks to study type I protoplanetary migration (§4). With this scheme, we can examine the effects of the turbulent perturbations on the migration of bodies that are not sufficiently massive to open gaps in a protostellar disk, and we can obtain an overall initial survey of the Type I migration problem. Our approach allows for a rapid survey of the important regions of parameter space, and is complementary to full-scale 3D MHD simulations which trace the evolution of a planet in an ionized circumstellar disk. Because the saturation of the magnetorotational instability occurs at nonlinear amplitudes, MHD-driven turbulence naturally produces large density fluctuations, which in turn produce torques that generally dominate those produced by the planetary wakes of objects with $M < 10M_{\oplus}$. We quantify this threshold by deriving an analytic estimate of the fluctuation amplitudes that are required for type I migration to be highly distorted (§5) and then discuss the longer term behavior (§6).

2. MHD Simulations

Our first step is to conduct a representative three-dimensional simulation to evaluate the expected properties of MHD turbulence in a model circumstellar disk. We use the “Nirvana” MHD code (Ziegler & Rüdiger 2000) as modified by Steinacker & Papaloizou (2002). We work in cylindrical coordinates (z, R, ϕ) , and use a system of units in which the gravitational constant, G , and the central stellar mass, M , are both unity. Our disk model has a nearly Keplerian radial domain that extends from an inner boundary at $R=1.5$

out to $R=3.5$, and covers an azimuthal slice that subtends $\pi/3$ radians. The equation of state is taken to be locally isothermal, with $P(R) = \rho(R)c_s(R)^2$ (see e.g. Laughlin & Bodenheimer 1994). This approximation is reasonable for optically thick disks whose local radiative diffusion time is shorter than the local dynamical (orbital) timescale. The gravitational potential from the central star is specified to depend only on the cylindrical radial coordinate $\Phi = -GM/R$. The model therefore does not consider the vertical density gradient that results from the z component of the gravitational force. This approximation simplifies the physical situation, allowing the use of a modest number of zones in the vertical direction. An obvious future refinement will be to study vertically stratified models. The reference simulation described here uses 334 radial zones, 72 azimuthal zones, and 40 vertical zones.

In the nearly Keplerian region of our initial equilibrium model, the disk density varies inversely with radius, $\rho(R) = \rho_0(R_0/R)$, the soundspeed is given by $c_s(R) = C_0\sqrt{R_0/R}$, and the rotational velocity is $v_\phi(R) = \sqrt{GM/R_0 - 2C_0^2}\sqrt{R_0/R}$. For numerical reasons, the disk also contains inner and outer radial boundary domains as described in Steinacker & Papaloizou (2002).

We adopt $C_0 = 0.1$, along with a subthermal poloidal seed field having zero net flux through the disk. With these starting parameters, the disk experiences the magnetorotational instability, progresses through the channel phase, and develops turbulence as described in detail by Steinacker & Papaloizou (2002). This configuration of initial conditions was found by Steinacker and Papaloizou (2002) and Hawley (2001) (among others) to lead to the smallest overall amplitude in the turbulent density fluctuations. Initial magnetic configurations with net flux threading the disk can lead to turbulent fluctuations that are up to two orders of magnitude larger. This turbulence persists for the duration of the simulation, which was followed to 200 orbits at the outer disk edge.

Figure 1 shows a map of the surface density distribution $\sigma(R, \phi)$ in the disk after the turbulence has entered its quasi-steady fully developed phase. The order-unity surface density fluctuations that are present in the disk provide the stochastic gravitational torques that are capable of severely modifying the type I migration process. The corresponding global Fourier amplitudes

$$C_m = \frac{|\int_0^{2\pi} \int_{R_{in}}^{R_{out}} \sigma(r, \phi) r dr \exp^{-im\phi} d\phi|}{\int_0^{2\pi} \int_{R_{in}}^{R_{out}} \sigma(r, \phi) r dr d\phi}, \quad (1)$$

of the disk fluctuations shown in Figure 1 are plotted as the filled black circles in Figure 2. The perturbation amplitude is strongest for the lowest azimuthal wavenumber ($m = 6$) that fits in the $\pi/3$ azimuthal domain. As the azimuthal mode number $m = 6n$ is increased through $n=2,3,4$, and 5, the Fourier amplitudes show a gradual decline. The concentration of power in lower-order Fourier modes is a characteristic of MHD-generated turbulence, and has been previously observed by other authors, including Armitage (1998), and Hawley et al (1995).

3. Parameterization of the Turbulence

In order to survey the effects of MHD turbulence on type I planet migration, we have chosen to construct a simple heuristic model to describe the perturbations. By characterizing the turbulence arising in the full MHD treatment in a simple manner, we can use the resulting prescription to specify the development of time-varying disk fluctuations in two-dimensional planet migration simulations. The alternative (and more rigorous) approach to the problem would involve running an expensive three-dimensional MHD simulation with every planet migration calculation. Each long-duration run of the MHD code requires, for example, 30,000 CPU hours on an Origin 3800 parallel processing facility (Nelson & Papaloizou 2003). Running enough simulations to sample the parameter space of interest is thus overly time-consuming.

We are primarily interested in the gravitational forces exerted on a migrating planet by the density perturbations arising from the MHD instabilities. We thus need a description of the potential perturbations Φ , which can be differenced to compute forces that act on the fluid elements; the gravitational forces from the resulting density enhancements then act on the planet itself. Specifically, we adopt a simple heuristic model for the potential Φ induced by the turbulent perturbations:

$$\Phi = \frac{A\xi e^{-(r-r_c)^2/\sigma^2}}{r^{1/2}} \cos[m\theta - \varphi - \Omega_c \tilde{t}] \sin\left[\pi \frac{\tilde{t}}{\Delta t}\right]. \quad (2)$$

With enough modes of this form, one can characterize the spectrum of density fluctuations produced by the MHD turbulence. Given the finite resolution of our codes, the computed MHD perturbations can be reasonably modeled by applying 50 modes at any given time. The modes come in and out of existence with the time dependence specified above, where $\tilde{t} = t - t_0$. An individual mode begins at time t_0 and has faded away after a time $\Delta t = t_f - t_0$. After the mode is gone, a new mode is generated. With the proper choice of the distributions of the remaining parameters (see below), we can reasonably mimic the power spectrum of density fluctuations in the actual MHD turbulence computed by the full three-dimensional code (see Figure 2).

The following parameter choices are found to work: The modes are centered at radial location r_c and initial angular location (phase angle) φ . The location of the mode r_c is chosen from a random (uniform) distribution, as is the phase angle φ . The extent of the mode is determined by the azimuthal wave number m which is chosen to be distributed according to a log-random distribution for wavenumbers in the range $2 \leq m \leq N_{grid}/8$ (where N_{grid} is the number of azimuthal zones in the simulation, typically 512 here). We find that the choice of a log-random distribution of m gives the best approximation to the density fluctuation spectrum produced by the MHD simulation; this spectrum of m provides power on all spatial scales. With m specified, the mode extends for a distance $2\pi r_c/m$ along

the azimuthal direction. The radial extent is then specified by choosing $\sigma = \pi r_c/4m$ so that the mode shapes have roughly a 4:1 aspect ratio (this statement is not precise because the profiles differ in the radial and azimuthal directions). Notice also that the initial mode shapes are not tilted as would be expected from the usual spiral patterns seen in disks; here, the durations of the modes are generally much longer than the time required for the Keplerian shear to adjust the orientations, so we can rely on the shear to take over.

The modes first appear at a time t_0 , which is chosen so that the simulation contains 50 active modes at all times. The pattern speed $\Omega_c = v_{kepler}/r_c$ in the time dependent factor allows the mode center to travel along with the Keplerian flow. The temporal duration of the mode $\Delta t = t_f - t_0$ is taken to be the sound crossing time of the mode along the angular direction, i.e., $\Delta t = 2\pi r_c/(ma_S)$.

Finally, the modes have an overall amplitude A and an individual amplitude ξ . As written, the amplitude A has units of $[A] = \ell^{5/2}t^{-2}$ (where ℓ is a length scale and t is a time scale) so that the overall expression has units of potential. The dimensionless variable ξ has a gaussian distribution with unit width, whereas the overall amplitude A has a fixed value for all of the modes. We can find the amplitude A that reproduces the level of perturbations found in the MHD simulation. Alternately, we can treat the amplitude A as an adjustable parameter and study the effects of these turbulent fluctuations on planet migration as a function of the amplitude (see below).

Figure 2 shows the power spectra from both the full MHD treatment of the previous section and the parametric model developed in this section. The two spectra are in good agreement. As a result, we employ this approach to specify the perturbations for migration calculations, as presented in the following section.

4. Migration with Turbulent Perturbations

With the perturbations due to MHD turbulence specified (as described in §3), we have performed fluid dynamic simulations of the migration of a terrestrial planet (or core of a giant planet) in the circumstellar disk. These simulations use a two-dimensional fluid dynamics code where we add the turbulent perturbations according to the prescription described above.

Our two-dimensional code (Laughlin 1994) is based on second-order van Leer advection (e.g. Stone & Nornam 1992). We generally use a grid of 256 evenly spaced radial zones and 512 azimuthal zones. The initial model has the same surface density and sounspeed distributions and the same active radial domain as was employed in the three-dimensional simulation. We minimize reflection by implementing sponge boundary conditions at the radial edges of the computational domain. In the $n_{di} = 12$ radial zones interior to $\xi = 1.6$, and in the $n_{do} = 12$ radial zones exterior to $\xi = 3.4$, we smoothly impose an admixture of the initial equilibrium solution into the hydrodynamically computed variables $x_{\text{hydro}}(\xi)$. That is, at the inner edge we have,

$$x(\xi_j) = \left(\frac{j-1}{n_{di}-1}\right)x_{\text{hydro}}(\xi_j) + \left(\frac{n_{di}-j}{n_{di}-1}\right)x_{\text{equil}}(\xi_j). \quad (3)$$

This damping is applied at a cadence $t_{di} = \Delta\xi(n_{di})/c_g$ at the inner edge, and $t_{do} = \Delta\xi(n_{do})/c_g$ at the outer edge, where $\Delta\xi(j)$ is the radial width of the uniformly spaced zones.

The planet mass is taken to be either 1 or 10 $M_{\oplus}$, and is initially placed in a circular orbit of semi-major axis (radius) $a = 2.5$ AU. (Note that all of these radii can be scaled). Over this restricted annulus covered by the hydrodynamical domain, the initial disk mass set to be a small fraction of the stellar mass, i.e., $M_d/M_* = 0.02$. The subsequent evolution of a $1M_{\oplus}$ planet in the $a - e$ plane is shown in Figure 3 for three different amplitudes of

the turbulent perturbations: $A = 5.0 \times 10^{-6}$, $A = 5.0 \times 10^{-5}$, and $A = 5.0 \times 10^{-4}$. The corresponding surface density perturbations are depicted in Figures 4, 5, and 6.

For small fluctuation amplitudes A , type I migration proceeds in largely unperturbed fashion. The planet slowly and steadily spirals inward. The fluid dynamic simulations only follow the planet for ~ 100 orbits in this class of simulations (see Figs. 3a and 4a). When, on the other hand, the fluctuation amplitude is large, the chaotic perturbations produced indirectly through turbulence dominate the torques produced by steady type I migration. In this regime, the evolution of the planet is highly chaotic (see Figs. 3c and 4c). In between these extremes, there exists a critical fluctuation amplitude, the value of A at which type I migration changes its character, but a general inward migration trend is still evident (Figs. 3b and 4b). The critical amplitude determined empirically from these two-dimensional disk simulations is $A_E \sim 1 \times 10^{-5}$. In the following section, we derive an analytic estimate for this critical value.

5. The Critical Amplitude

Equation (2) gives the potential produced by the turbulent fluctuations. The gradient of this potential provides a forcing term that acts on the gas in the disk (but does not act directly on the planet) and thereby produces corresponding fluctuations in the surface density of the disk. To obtain a rough understanding of the critical fluctuation amplitude A_C required for turbulence to overwhelm the standard type I migration torques, we assume here that the gravitational potential of the perturbed gaseous disk (where this potential does act on the planet) has the same form as that of equation (2). However, the amplitude of the potential acting on the planet will, in general, be reduced from that acting on the gas by a factor $\Gamma \leq 1$ (which we estimate below). The torques exerted on the planet by the

surface density perturbations in the disk will thus have the form

$$\tau = -\frac{mA\xi\Gamma M_P}{r^{1/2}} e^{-(r-r_c)^2/\sigma^2} \sin[m\theta - \varphi - \Omega_c \tilde{t}] \sin[\pi \tilde{t}/\Delta t], \quad (4)$$

where M_P is the mass of the planet and all the other quantities are defined previously. At any given time, the disk will contain 50 modes that exert torques of this form. To evaluate the effectiveness of these torques, we need to define an average torque strength. First, we integrate over time to obtain the net change in angular momentum per mode, i.e.,

$$\Delta J = \int_0^{\Delta t} dt \tau = \frac{mA\xi\Gamma M_P}{r^{1/2}} e^{-(r-r_c)^2/\sigma^2} \frac{\Delta t}{\pi} \frac{\sin(a\pi - \varphi) - \sin \varphi}{a^2 - 1}, \quad (5)$$

where the parameter a is defined to be $a \equiv (m\Omega - \Omega_c)\Delta t/\pi$. The mean torque per mode τ_1 , averaged over the lifetime of the mode, is thus given by

$$\tau_1 = \frac{\Delta J}{\Delta t} = \frac{A\Gamma M_P}{r^{1/2}} \mathcal{F} \quad \text{where} \quad \mathcal{F} \equiv \frac{m\xi}{\pi} e^{-(r-r_c)^2/\sigma^2} \frac{\sin(a\pi - \varphi) - \sin \varphi}{a^2 - 1}, \quad (6)$$

where the variables r_c , φ , ξ , and m are chosen randomly as described in §3.

At any given time, the disk contains 50 modes and hence 50 values of the function $\mathcal{F}$. Since these torques can either be positive or negative, the 50 modes will tend to cancel each other out, and the net effect forcing effect will be relatively small. We thus need to compute the forcing function $\mathcal{F}_{50}$ defined by

$$\mathcal{F}_{50} \equiv \sum_{j=1}^{50} \mathcal{F}_j, \quad (7)$$

where the $\mathcal{F}_j$ are sampled in the same way that the numerical simulations sample parameter space. The function $\mathcal{F}_{50}$ should average to zero (or some low value) because the torques can be positive or negative. However, the RMS value of $\mathcal{F}_{50}$, denoted here as $\langle \mathcal{F}_{50} \rangle$, should provide a good measure for the effective strength of this torque. Numerically sampling the function shows that $\langle \mathcal{F}_{50} \rangle \approx 0.29$. Putting these results together, we find that the average torque τ_T exerted on the planet through the action of turbulence is given by

$$\tau_T = \langle \mathcal{F}_{50} \rangle \frac{A\Gamma M_P}{r^{1/2}} \approx 0.29 \frac{A\Gamma M_P}{r^{1/2}}. \quad (8)$$

To estimate the response amplitude Γ of the disk (due to the potential induced by turbulent fluctuations), we use a simple linearized WKB treatment of a two-dimensional disk (Shu 1992). Unlike the usual spiral density wave theory, however, we include only the forcing due to the fluctuation potential Φ and neglect the self-gravity of the disk. In the WKB limit, we can solve for the radial part of the reduced surface density perturbation S in terms of the forcing potential Φ to obtain

$$S = \frac{k^2 \sigma_d \Phi}{(\omega - m\Omega)^2 - \kappa^2 - k^2 a_S^2}, \quad (9)$$

where the epicyclic frequency $\kappa = \Omega$ for a Keplerian disk. Next, we need to use the relationship between the surface density perturbation S and the corresponding gravitational potential V . In the WKB limit, this relation has been calculated previously (e.g., Shu 1992) and can be written in the form

$$S \approx -\frac{|k|V}{2\pi G}. \quad (10)$$

Equating the expressions for the surface density response to the turbulent fluctuations (eq. [9]) and the corresponding perturbation in the gravitational potential (eq. [10]), we can solve for the response factor Γ , i.e.,

$$\Gamma \approx \frac{V}{\Phi} \approx \frac{2\pi G \sigma_d k}{(\omega - m\Omega)^2 - \Omega^2 - k^2 a_S^2}. \quad (11)$$

To evaluate this expression, we must make further simplifying assumptions. The turbulent fluctuations induce modes with relatively large wavenumbers $m = 2 - 32$, so we can approximate the denominator as $|\mathcal{D}| \sim m^2 \Omega^2 = m^2 G M_*/r^3$. Given the radial dependence of the turbulent fluctuations (eq. [2]), we can estimate the radial wavenumber k in the WKB limit: $kr = (r/\Phi)(\partial\Phi/\partial r) \sim 2r^2/\sigma^2 \sim 32m^2/\pi^2$. The expression for Γ thus becomes

$$\Gamma = \frac{\pi \sigma_d r^2}{M_*} \frac{64}{\pi^2} \approx 0.06. \quad (12)$$

Next, we need to compare the average torque produced through turbulent fluctuations with that produced by the usual type I migration mechanism (Ward 1997). This torque τ_I

can be written

$$\tau_I = \beta_I (M_P/M_*)^2 (\pi \sigma_d r^2) (r\Omega)^2 (r/H)^3, \quad (13)$$

where H is the disk scale height, σ_d is the disk surface density, and β_I is a dimensionless amplitude. Previous calculations suggest that $\beta_I \sim 10^{-2}$ (Ward 1997).

By equating τ_T and τ_I , we can solve for the critical amplitude A_C for which the torques due to turbulence become larger than those of standard type I migration. We find

$$A_C = \frac{17\pi^2}{64} \beta_I (M_P/M_*) (r/H)^3 r^{1/2} (r\Omega)^2 \approx 1 \times 10^{-5}, \quad (14)$$

where the numerical value is obtained using the same parameters as in the numerical simulations presented here (for a one Earth mass planet). This analytic estimate for the critical amplitude is in good agreement with that observed in the numerical simulations themselves – which show an empirically determined value of $A_E \sim 1 \times 10^{-5}$ (see §4).

Before leaving this section, we note that the torque produced by type I migration (eq. [13]) and that produced indirectly through turbulence (eq. [8]) scale differently with the mass of the planet. Small planetesimals, with masses $m \ll M_E$, will be tossed around violently because of MHD turbulence. On the other hand, sufficiently large planets can be impervious to its effects (for sufficiently small amplitudes A). If we assume that the maximum fluctuation amplitude $A_{\max} \approx r^{1/2} (r\Omega)^2$, then we can define a critical mass scale M_{CP} , such that larger masses will always be dominated by type I migration torques. This mass scale is given by $M_{CP}/M_* = (64/\pi^2 \beta_I) (r/H)^3 \approx 0.04$. Secondary bodies with such large masses are generally brown dwarfs and not planets. Furthermore, such large bodies tend to open up gaps and experience type II migration (Goldreich & Tremaine 1980; Lin & Papaloizou 1993; Ward 1997). As a result, there is no regime of parameter space for which type I migration torques necessarily dominate those produced by MHD turbulence.

6. Long Term Evolution

Given our analytic description of the effects of turbulence, we can understand the possible range of migration behavior over longer time intervals. This analytic approach is necessary, as it is difficult for numerical simulations to remain stable over millions of orbits, the dynamical time frames of the migration process. As we discuss below, several complications arise in the long term.

First, even if the amplitude of the turbulent fluctuations is that required for the resulting torques to have the same amplitude as those of type I migration (i.e., if $A = A_C$), the two sources of torque have different accumulative effects. The type I migration torque τ_I is a secular torque that consistently moves the planet in one direction. The net turbulent torque τ_T can be either positive or negative and changes its value over a sampling time that we denote here at t_{smp} . The changes in angular momentum accumulate in random walk fashion. The change in angular momentum over the integrated time interval $t = Nt_{\text{smp}}$, for the two contributions, can thus be written in the form

$$(\Delta J)_I = N\tau_I t_{\text{smp}} \quad \text{and} \quad (\Delta J)_T = \sqrt{N}\tau_T t_{\text{smp}}. \quad (15)$$

The sampling time t_{smp} is the time required for the disk to produce an independent realization of the turbulent torques. The lifetime of a mode with wavenumber m is $\Delta t = 2\pi r/(ma_S)$, which can be written in the form $\Delta t = (2\pi/\Omega)(r/mH)$. The first factor is the orbital period P_{orb} . The second factor is of order unity: The disk generally has $r/H \approx 10$ and the wavenumber m lies in the range $2 \leq m \leq 32$. Since the wavenumbers m are logarithmically spaced and the lowest m modes live the longest (and are near the peak of the power spectrum – see Fig. 2), the appropriate value of m to use in estimating the sampling time lies near the low end of the range. As a result, we expect $t_{\text{smp}} \sim P_{\text{orb}}$. In order for the turbulent fluctuations to dominate over a specified time interval t_f , the amplitude of the turbulent fluctuations must be larger than the critical value A_C by an

additional factor, i.e.,

$$A \geq \left(\frac{t_f}{P_{\text{orb}}} \right)^{1/2} A_C. \quad (16)$$

A sufficiently large amplitude can keep the turbulent fluctuations dominant over the entire lifetime of the disk. The expected disk lifetime t_{disk} (specifically, the time over which planet migration takes place) is of order 1 – 3 Myr (Haisch, Lada, & Lada 2001), while expected timescales for Type I migration of individual (Earth mass) planetesimals are considerably shorter, of order 10^5 years (Ward 1997). The orbit time P_{orb} is of order 1 – 3 yr. So this problem contains another critical amplitude, namely that required for the turbulent fluctuations to overwhelm type I migration torques over a 10^5 year secular migration timescale. This second critical amplitude A_2 is estimated to be

$$A_2 \approx \left(\frac{t_{\text{disk}}}{P_{\text{orb}}} \right)^{1/2} A_C \sim 0.003. \quad (17)$$

A useful benchmark is the number of steps N (or, equivalently, the time scale NP_{orb}) required for the random walk process to completely change the angular momentum. In other words, we set $(\Delta J)_T = \sqrt{GM_* r}$ in equation (16) and solve for N to find

$$N = \left[\left(\frac{A}{r^{5/2} \Omega^2} \right) 2\pi \mathcal{F}_{50} \Gamma \right]^{-2}. \quad (18)$$

Even for fluctuations with the critical amplitude $A = A_C$, this number is rather large: $N \sim 3 \times 10^8$, with a corresponding time scale of 300 Myr. On the other hand, for $A = A_2$, the required number of steps falls to $N \sim 3 \times 10^3$, with a time scale of ~ 3000 yr.

Another complication is the radial dependence of the critical amplitude A_C . As shown by equation (14), this ratio scales as $A_C \propto r^{3-3q/2}$, where q is the power-law index of the disk temperature profile. Although the temperature will not be purely a power-law, q is nonetheless expected to lie the range $1/2 \leq q \leq 3/4$, so that the index $3 - 3q/2 = 15/8 - 9/4 \approx 2$. As a result, the amplitude of the turbulent modes required to dominate the type

I migration torque is a rapidly increasing function of radius r (decreasing as the planet moves in). As the planet migrates inward, $A_C \propto r^2$ decreases and turbulence tends to dominate to an ever greater extent. On the other hand, if MHD turbulence shuts down in the inner disk due to magnetic decoupling (e.g., Fromang, Terquem, & Balbus 2002), then standard type I migration is resumed.

7. Discussion and Conclusion

In this paper, we have generalized the scenario of type I planet migration to include the effects of fluctuations produced by MHD turbulence. To characterize the turbulence itself, we have run three-dimensional MHD simulations to study the onset and character of the turbulence, and used the results to specify the power spectrum of turbulent fluctuations. These perturbations were then parameterized and used in a second set of two-dimensional numerical simulations that study the migration phase itself. Finally, we have developed an analytic description of the turbulent fluctuations, the torques they produce, and their long term effects on the migration process. Our specific results are summarized below:

MHD turbulence produces a full spectrum of fluctuations that peaks at relatively low azimuthal wavenumbers $m \sim 1 - 6$ (Figs. 1 and 2). These fluctuations can be characterized by potential fluctuations of the form given by equation (2). The formulation developed here may be useful in many other astronomical applications because it allows the fluctuations produced by turbulence to be effectively modeled with a minimum of computational effort, and even allows for many results to be determined analytically (see §5).

The effects of turbulence on type I migration depend sensitively on the amplitude of the turbulent potential perturbations. Further, we have found the critical threshold A_C for this amplitude, using both two-dimensional numerical simulations of the migration

process (Figs. 3 and 4) and an analytic treatment (eq. [14]). For perturbation amplitudes below this threshold ($A < A_C$) type I migration proceeds smoothly inward, as envisioned by the original scenario. For small but finite amplitudes, the turbulence leads to random fluctuations superimposed on the smooth inward migration, but the general trend remains. If the amplitude exceeds the threshold ($A > A_C$), the perturbations due to turbulence produce torques that are stronger than those induced by the planetary wake, and the evolution changes dramatically. Instead of displaying a smooth, inward progression, the planet exhibits random walk behavior. The planet can even move outward when the turbulence amplitude is large enough.

The critical amplitudes are $A_C \approx 1 \times 10^{-5}$ for a 1 Earth mass planet and $A_C \approx 1 \times 10^{-4}$ for a 10 Earth mass planet. These critical amplitudes are found both in the two-dimensional numerical simulations of type I migration and by the analytic treatment of §5. For comparison, the expected amplitudes for the perturbations are $A \sim Z \sim 10^{-3}$, comfortably larger than the critical amplitudes needed to change the migration scenario. As a result, we expect MHD turbulence to change the character of the type I migration process under typical disk conditions.

The main conclusion of this paper is that the typical migration torques in a circumstellar disk will often be dominated by the perturbations due to MHD turbulence rather than the steady planetary wakes that drive type I migration. As a result, type I migration will often display far richer behavior than has been considered previously. When MHD instabilities are robust, migration will generally proceed in a highly chaotic fashion, with an element of a random walk behavior, although the underlying conventional type I secular torque acts to drive the planet inwards over the long term. The complications introduced by turbulence have two important implications: (1) The time scale for planet migration can be quite different, either longer or shorter, when turbulence is present. (2) The result of any given

migration episode in a circumstellar disk cannot be described by a single outcome; instead, due to chaos and extreme sensitivity to initial conditions, the result of a migration episode must be described in terms of a distribution of possible outcomes. In particular, the time scale required for planets to migrate inward will display a full distribution of values.

This chaotic element – including the necessity of finding the full distribution of possible outcomes – has recently been emphasized for migration scenarios that involve planet-scattering (Adams & Laughlin 2003). Other recent work (Nelson & Papaloizou 2003; Papaloizou & Nelson 2003; Winters, Balbus, & Hawley 2003) outlines the effects of turbulence and chaos for type II migration. Since this paper shows that type I migration can often be dominated by turbulence/chaos as well, nearly all possible mechanisms for planet migration are expected to display chaotic behavior. The ubiquity of chaotic processes during the formation and early evolution of planetary systems certainly contributes to the startling diversity that is observed among the known extrasolar planets

This work was supported by NASA Ames through an award from the Director’s Discretionary Fund program, and by the NASA Origins of Solar Systems Program under contract No. RTOP 344-37-22-12.

REFERENCES

- Adams, F. C., & Laughlin, G. 2003, *Icarus*, 163, 290
- Armitage, P. J. 1998, *ApJ*, 501, L189
- Balbus, S. A., & Hawley, J. F. 1991, *ApJ*, 376, 214
- Fromang, S., Terquem, C., & Balbus, S. A. 2002, *MNRAS*, 329, 18
- Goldreich, P., & Tremaine, S. 1980, *ApJ*, 241, 425
- Goodman, J., & Rafikov, R. R. 2001, *ApJ*, 52, 793
- Haisch, K. E., Lada, E. A., & Lada, C. J. 2001, *ApJ*, 553, 153
- Hawley, J. 2001, *ApJ*, 554, 534
- Hawley, J. F., Gammie, C. F., & Balbus, S. A. 1995, *ApJ*, 440, 742
- Laughlin, G., 1994, Ph.D. Thesis, University of California, Santa Cruz
- Laughlin, G., & Bodenheimer, P. 1994, *ApJ*, 436, 335
- Lin, D.N.C., Bodenheimer, P., & Richardson, D. C. 1996, *Nature*, 380, 606
- Lin, D.N.C., & Papaloizou, J.C.B. 1993, *Protostars and Planets III*, eds. E. H. Levy & J. I. Lunine (Tucson: Univ. Arizona Press), p. 749
- Lissauer, J. J. 1993, *ARA&A*, 31, 129
- Marcy, G., & Butler, P. R. 1996, *ApJ*, 464, L147
- Mayor, M., & Queloz, D. 1995, *Nature*, 378, 355
- Nelson, R. P., & Papaloizou, J.C.B. 2003, *MNRAS*, 339, 993

- Papaloizou, J.C.B., & Nelson, R. P. 2003, MNRAS, 339, 983
- Shu, F. H. 1992, Gas Dynamics (Mill Valley: Univ. Science Books)
- Steinacker, A., & Papaloizou, J.C.B., 2002, ApJ, 571, 413
- Stone, J., & Norman, M., 1992, ApJS, 80, 753
- Terquem, C. E. 2003, MNRAS, 341, 1157
- Ward, W. R. 1997, Icarus, 126, 261
- Winters, W. F., Balbus, S. A., & Hawley, J. F. 2003, ApJ, 589, 543
- Ziegler, U., & Rüdiger, G. 2000, A&A, 356, 1141

Fig. 1.— Surface density distribution in a $\pi/3$ wedge of a circumstellar disk resulting from a three-dimensional simulation of MHD turbulence. Gravitational torques arising from these fluctuations will stochastically alter the orbits of protoplanets embedded in the disk.

Fig. 2.— Non-axisymmetric modal amplitudes observed in the numerical simulations. The solid black circles show the global fourier amplitudes C_{6m} measured in the MHD-turbulent three-dimensional simulation at the time plotted in Figure 1. The solid red triangles show the amplitudes C_m observed in a two-dimensional hydrodynamical simulation in which a $1M_{\oplus}$ protoplanet is embedded in a $0.02 M_{\odot}$ disk, and perturbed as described by equation 2 with $A = 5.0 \times 10^{-4}$. The open red squares show the amplitudes C_m observed in a similar simulation with $A = 5.0 \times 10^{-5}$. The solid blue circles show the amplitudes C_m observed in a simulation containing a $1M_{\oplus}$ protoplanet embedded in a disk with $A = 0$.

Fig. 3.— Type I migration simulations using a two-dimensional fluid code and the parametric treatment of the perturbations due to MHD turbulence. The three panels show time evolution of the migrating planet in the $a - e$ plane for fluctuations with low amplitude (a) where $A = 5.0 \times 10^{-6} \sim A_C/2$, threshold amplitude (b) where $A = 5.0 \times 10^{-5} \sim 5A_C$, and high amplitude (c) where $A = 5.0 \times 10^{-4} \sim 50A_C$. All of these simulations use a planet with one Earth mass. Planets with higher mass behave similarly if the amplitude of the turbulent fluctuations is increased accordingly (see text).

Fig. 4.— Type I migration simulation using a two-dimensional fluid code and the parametric treatment of the perturbations due to MHD turbulence. Perturbations in the surface density of the disk are shown after 50 orbits of an embedded $1M_{\oplus}$ protoplanet for the case of turbulent fluctuations with low amplitude $A = 5.0 \times 10^{-6} \sim A_C/10$. The color scale ranges from $\sigma(r, \phi)/\langle \sigma(r) \rangle = 0.998$ (black) to $\sigma(r, \phi)/\langle \sigma(r) \rangle = 1.00836$ (orange).

Fig. 5.— Same as the previous figure, but with amplitude $A = 5.0 \times 10^{-5} \sim A_C$. The color scale ranges from $\sigma(r, \phi) / \langle \sigma(r) \rangle = 0.992$ (black) to $\sigma(r, \phi) / \langle \sigma(r) \rangle = 1.00861$ (orange).

Fig. 6.— Same as the previous figure, but with amplitude $A = 5.0 \times 10^{-4} \sim 10A_C$. The color scale ranges from $\sigma(r, \phi) / \langle \sigma(r) \rangle = 0.899$ (black) to $\sigma(r, \phi) / \langle \sigma(r) \rangle = 1.0801$ (orange).

This figure "fig1.gif" is available in "gif" format from:

<http://arXiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0308406v1>

This figure "fig2.gif" is available in "gif" format from:

<http://arXiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0308406v1>

This figure "fig3.gif" is available in "gif" format from:

<http://arXiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0308406v1>

This figure "fig4.gif" is available in "gif" format from:

<http://arXiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0308406v1>

This figure "fig5.gif" is available in "gif" format from:

<http://arXiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0308406v1>

This figure "fig6.gif" is available in "gif" format from:

<http://arXiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0308406v1>